February 24, 2011

Mr Naoto Kan Prime Minister of Japan

Honorable Prime Minister,

We are writing to urge you to prevent a loan guarantee from the Japan Bank for International Cooperation (JBIC) for the proposed atomic reactor project at the South Texas site in the U.S. state of Texas. Such a loan would entail extraordinary financial and social risk for the JBIC and the Japanese people.

All currently proposed reactor projects in the United States face a challenging economic environment caused by unfavorable market conditions; escalating projected construction costs; decreased electricity demand growth; low natural gas prices and increased competition from safe, clean renewable energy sources. With a deregulated, competitive power market and some of the lowest wholesale electricity prices in the country, Texas is a particularly risky U.S. state in which to invest in expensive new reactors.

The projected cost for the two South Texas reactors has increased from \$5.6 billion in 2006 to as much as \$18 billion today. Last year, the City of San Antonio reduced its investment in the project by 85 percent because of the rising cost estimates. San Antonio's municipal utility, CPS Energy, sued their partner NRG Energy (the loan guarantee applicant) for \$32 billion, alleging fraud, illegal conduct, and conspiracy over cost estimates and citing NRG's deals with outside partners. NRG has been desperately pursuing other municipal utilities to commit to purchase electricity from the proposed reactors by promising fixed priced energy and other incentives that would further undermine the economic viability of the project.

New nuclear reactors in Texas would produce energy at far higher costs than the market price of power in the state. An independent assessment conducted for Texas' main grid operator ERCOT (Electric Reliability Council of Texas) found that the cost of the South Texas reactors would exceed the revenue they would generate in the market by 33 to 52 percent.<sup>2</sup>

Texas has a host of lower-cost alternatives, especially wind and natural gas, that will continue to meet the need for electricity. Texas is the number one wind market in the United States with more than 8,000MW in service. Natural gas reserves are adequate for 100 years, thus assuring low-cost energy for a long time. A 2010 analysis done for ERCOT projects per kilowatt capital costs for solar power to already be cheaper than nuclear power in Texas—a cost advantage that is projected to grow wider under every possible scenario envisioned.<sup>3</sup> Currently, the average

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Nuclear Expansion could cost \$18.2 billon, San Antonio Express-News, December 23, 2009

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Potomac Economics, LTD., Independent Market Monitor for the ERCOT Wholesale Market, 2009 State of the Market Report for the ERCOT Wholesale Electricity Markets, July 2010, <a href="http://www.puc.state.tx.us/wmo/documents/annual\_reports/2009annualreport.pdf">http://www.puc.state.tx.us/wmo/documents/annual\_reports/2009annualreport.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> ERCOT Scenario Development Working Group, *Scenario Assumptions Spreadsheet*, , September 2010. http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2010/09/20100910-SDWG

wholesale cost for electricity in Texas is 3.7 cents per kilowatt-hour, while electricity from new reactors with capital costs in South Texas' range is estimated to cost between 12 cents to 20 cents per kilowatt-hour. Moreover, the large projected increases in electricity demand made just a few years ago – which served as the basis for many new reactor proposals – are now highly unlikely to be reached for another decade or more. This is partly due to the U.S. recession, of course, but also due to increasing energy efficiency throughout the U.S. economy.

Due to Japanese corporate involvement in the proposed South Texas reactor project, it might appear that it would make a good investment. The reality, however, is that the projects involving Japanese companies will suffer the same delays, design problems, financial difficulties and determined public opposition as other proposed nuclear projects.

Moreover, the history of U.S. nuclear reactor construction does not provide room for optimism. According to a 1986 study from the U.S. Department of Energy's Energy Information Administration (EIA), the average cost overrun of the first 75 U.S. nuclear reactor projects was 207 percent – or more than triple the original estimated cost. The cost overruns of the last 50 reactors built in the U.S. were even higher, reaching as much as 800% over-budget. Such extraordinary cost overruns led to multi-billion-dollar bond defaults, utility bankruptcy, and significant financial losses by utilities. Nothing in the U.S. experience suggests that new reactor projects will be any more successful at containing costs than past projects.

Just as we have warned American taxpayers and elected officials about these very serious financial risks, we also urge you to very carefully consider these risks before deciding to invest in new reactors in the United States. We respectfully suggest that Japanese taxpayers would not want to lose money on a U.S. reactor project. Nor would U.S. taxpayers want to bail out JBIC when the predictable losses occur. Such outcomes would obviously be uncomfortable on both sides of the Pacific.

cc:

Mr Banri Kaieda Minister of Economy, Trade and Industry

Mr Yoshihiko Noda Minister of Finance

Mr Koichiro Gemba Minister for National Policy

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> An Analysis of Nuclear Power Plant Construction Costs, January 1, 1986, Energy Information Administration, Technical Report DOE/EIA-0485

## Sincerely,

## **Organizations in United States**

Michael Mariotte Executive Director

Nuclear Information and Resource Service

Takoma Park, MD

Michele Boyd

Physicians for Social Responsibility

Washington, DC

Jim Riccio Greenpeace USA Washington, DC

Ben Schreiber Friends of the Earth Washington, DC

Kevin Kamps Beyond Nuclear Takoma Park, MD

Ken Bossong Sun Day Coalition Takoma Park, MD

Fr. Séamus P. Finn, OMI

Director, Justice/Peace and Integrity of Creation Office

Missionary Oblates of Mary Immaculate

Washington, DC

Nikos Pastos

Center for Water Advocacy

Homer, AK

Dennis Larson

People's Action for Safe Energy

Parthenon, AR

Pat Birnie

GE Stockholders Alliance

Tucson, AZ

Stephen Brittle Don't Waste Arizona Phoenix, AZ

Julia Rouvier, Co-founder

Flagstaff Nuclear Awareness Project

Flagstaff, AZ

Robert M. Gould, MD

President

SF-Bay Area Chapter

Physicians for Social Responsibility

San Francisco, CA

David Krieger President

Nuclear Age Peace Foundation

Santa Barbara, CA

Rinaldo Brutoco

World Business Academy

Santa Barbara, CA

Philip Tymon

Occidental Arts and Ecology Center

Occidental, CA

Ernest Goitein and Claire Feder

Co-coordinators

Californians for Radioactive Safeguards

Atherton, CA

Marylia Kelley, Executive Director Tri-Valley CAREs Livermore, CA

Christie Kelley Board Chair

Peace and Justice Network of San Joaquin County

Stockton, CA

Roger Dittmann, Ph.D.

President

Scientists without Borders

Fullerton, CA

**Todd Steiner** 

Turtle Island Restoration Network

Forest Knolls, CA

Don May

California Earthcorps Long Beach, CA

Michael Welch Redwood Alliance Arcata, CA

New Canaan, CT

Lori Price Editor-in-Chief

Citizens For Legitimate Government

Bristol, CT

Alan Muller Executive Director Green Delaware Port Penn, DE

Cara L. Campbell

Chair

Ecology Party of Florida Ft. Lauderdale, FL

Richard Hausman Treasurer R&R Foundation Bradenton, FL

Nancy O'Byrne

Pax Christi Northeast Florida

St. Augustine, FL

Tom Conroy Conroy Roofing, LLC Naples, FL

Marilyn Blackwell President

Help Save the Apalachicola River Group

Wewahitchka, FL

Tim Steorts Chair Polk Action for a Cleaner Environment Lake Wales, FL

Sara Barczak

Southern Alliance for Clean Energy

Savannah, GA

Glenn Carroll Coordinator Nuclear Watch South Atlanta, GA

Tom Ferguson

Coordinator Foundation for Global Community Atlanta, GA

Bob Darby Coordinator

Kristofer Young Executive Board Member Citizens for Peaceful Resolutions Ventura, CA

Harry Wang, MD

President

Physicians for Social Responsibility/Sacramento

Sacramento, CA

Brian Kie Weissbuch L.Ac.

CEO

KW Botanicals Inc. San Anselmo, CA

Larry Harper Peace Crane Project Sonoma County, CA

Mary Beth Brangan and James Heddle

Co-Directors

Ecological Options Network, EON

Bolinas, CA

Jerry Mander

International Forum on Globalization

San Francisco, CA

Lyn Harris Hicks

Coalition for Responsible and Ethical Environmental

Decisions

San Clemente, CA

**Hunter Lovins** 

Natural Capitalism Inc

Longmont, CO

Sharyn Cunningham

Co-Chair

Colorado Citizens Against Toxic Waste, Inc.

Canon City, CO

Nancy Burton, Director

Connecticut Coalition Against Millstone

CT

Judi Friedman

PACE (People's Action for Clean Energy, Inc.)

Canton, CT

Lee Evans

Sierra Club of Connecticut's Anti- Nuclear Committee

Food Not Bombs Atlanta, GA

Adele Kushner Executive Director

Action for a Clean Environment

Alto, GA

Earthcorps, of He'eia

Hawaii

Earthcorps Hawaiian Hui

Hawaii

Carolyn Treadway No New Nukes Normal, IL

Laureen J. Dunne

Director

Citizens Active in Reclaiming the Environment

(CARE) La Grange, IL

Maureen Headington

President

Stand Up/Save Lives Campaign

Burr Ridge, IL

David A. Kraft Director NEIS Chicago, IL

Patrick Bosold Conservation Chair

Leopold Group, S.E. Iowa chapter, Iowa Sierra Club

Fairfield, IA

William S. Linnell Spokesperson Cheaper, Safer Power Portland, ME

Denise Dreher Pax Christi Maine Biddeford, ME

Max Obuszewski

Baltimore Nonviolence Center

Baltimore, MD

Dennis Nelson

Director, Support and Education for Radiation Victims

Bethesda, MD

Dagmar Fabian

Crabshell Alliance of Greater Baltimore.

Baltimore, MD

Jonathan Mark Flyby News

Wendell Depot, MA

Corinne Carey

Grand Rapids coordinator Don't Waste Michigan Grand Rapids, MI

Michael J. Keegan

Coalition for a Nuclear Free Great Lakes

Monroe, MI

Alice Hirt

Don't Waste Michigan

Holland, MI

Keith Gunter

Citizens' Resistance at Fermi Two

Monroe, MI

Jesse P. Van Gerven

Missourians for Safe Energy

Columbia, MO

Henry M. Stoever PeaceWorks Kansas City Kansas City, MO

Monta Welch Founder/Director

Columbia Climate Change Coalition

Columbia, MO

Monta Welch Founder/President

Interfaith Care for Creation

Columbia, MO

Leo Cashman Executive Director

DAMS, Inc. (Dental Amalgam Mercury Solutions)

St. Paul, MN

Buffalo Bruce Staff Ecologist

Western Nebraska Resources Council

Chadron, NE

Paula Gotsch

Grandmothers, Mothers and More for Energy Safety

(GRAMMES)

NJ

Janet Greenwald

Citizens for Alternatives to Radioactive Dumping

Albuquerque, NM

Greg Mello

Los Alamos Study Group

Santa Fe, NM

Joni Arends Executive Director

Concerned Citizens for Nuclear Safety

Santa Fe, NM

Douglas Meiklejohn, Executive Director New Mexico Environmental Law Center

Santa Fe, NM

Multicultural Alliance for a Safe Environment

NM

Candace Head-Dylla

President

Bluewater Valley Downstream Alliance

Grants, NM

Just Environmental Systems for Unity and

Sustainability

NM

Marian Naranjo

Director

Honor Our Pueblo Existence (H.O.P.E.)

Espanola, NM

Lesley Weinstock Coordinator

Agua es Vida Action Team (AVAT)

Albuquerque, NM

Judy Treichel

Nevada Nuclear Waste Task Force

Las Vegas, NV

Gary Vesperman

COO and Director of Research Blue Energy Corporation

Boulder City, NV

Paul and Ellen Connett Fluoride Action Network

Canton, NY

Susan Shapiro

Public Health and Sustainable Energy (PHASE)

Spring Valley, NY

George Sidoti

President/founder

New Five Star Millennium Entertainment, Inc.

East Northport, NY

Madeline Labriola

Coordinator

Pax Christi of the Hudson Valley

Highland, NY

Patricia & Peter Ladley

Pax Christi Elmira, NY

Dr. Kathleen Sullivan

Program Director

Hibakusha Stories

New York, NY

Joanne Steele

Informed Consent

St. Remy, NY

Jim Warren

**Executive Director** 

NC WARN

Waste Awareness & Reduction Network

Durham, NC

Lewis E. Patrie, M.D.

Chair

Western N. C. Physicians for Social Responsibility

Asheville, NC

Mali Lightfoot

Director of Development

Helen Caldicott Foundation/NuclearFreePlanet.org

Asheville, NC

Wells Eddleman

NC Citizens Research Group

Durham, NC

Mary Olson

NIRS Southeast

Asheville, NC

Chris Borello

President

Concerned Citizens of Lake Twp./ Uniontown IEL

Superfund Site

Uniontown, OH

Patricia A. Marida

Ohio Sierra Club Nuclear Issues Committee National Sierra Club Nuclear Issues Activist Team Columbus. OH

Ohio CARE - Citizens Against a Radioactive

Environment Cleveland, OH

The Concerned Citizens Network of Cuyahoga, Lake,

Ashtabula & Geauga Counties

OH

Barbara Geary

Citizens Action for Safe Energy

Tulsa, OK

Peggy J. Salas

Esperanza Development LLC

Stillwater, OK

Nina Bell, J.D. Executive Director

Northwest Environmental Advocates

Portland, OR

Chuck Johnson Director

Center for Energy Research

Portland, OR

Lloyd K. Marbet Executive Director

Oregon Conservancy Foundation

Boring, OR

Ernest Fuller

Concerned Citizens for SNEC Safety

Six Mile Run, PA

Titus North

Deputy Executive Director

Citizen Power Pittsburgh, PA

Wm. Wharton Smith III U.S.A. Nica Windpower, Inc.

Jamestown, RI

Finian Taylor

Hilton Head for Peace Hilton Head, SC

Kathleen Ferris Co-Founder

Citizens to End Nuclear Dumping in TN

Murfreesboro, TN

Rev. Walter Stark

Cumberland Countians for Peace & Justice

Pleasant Hill, TN

Donald B. Clark

Network for Environmental & Economic

Responsibility

United Church of Christ

Pleasant Hill, TN

Karen Hadden Executive Director

Sustainable Energy and Economic Development

(SEED) Coalition Austin, TX

Tom "Smitty" Smith

Director

Public Citizen's Texas Office

Austin, TX

Cynthia Weehler Energia Mia San Antonio, TX

Trevor Lovell Director

ReEnergize Texas

Austin, TX

Robert Wright

Texas Chapter of the Oblate Justice, Peace, and

**Integrity of Creation Commission** 

San Antonio, TX

Ruben Solis

Centro por la Justice San Antonio, TX

Jill Johnston

Southwest Workers Union

San Antonio, TX

Sandra Garcia

Youth Leadership Organization

San Antonio, TX

Robert Alvarado

Committee for Environmental Justice Action

San Antonio, TX

Bill Addington

**Executive Committee** 

El Paso Regional Sierra Club Group

El Paso, TX

Marian Morris Director

Austin Physicians for Social Responsibility

Austin, TX

Maria Antonietta Berriozabal

Santuario Sisterfarm

Boerne, TX

Jim Klein Chair

Clean Economy Coalition of Corpus Christi

Corpus Christi, TX

Ann Marie Ewing

President

South Texas Opposes Pollution (STOP)

Kingsville, TX

Jason Von Kundra

GMU Environmental Action Group

Fairfax, VA

Rian Fried President

Clean Yield Asset Management

Norwich, VT

Debra Stoleroff

Vermont Yankee Decommissioning Alliance

Montpelier, VT

Greg Wingard, **Executive Director** Waste Action Project

Seattle, WA

Leonard Eiger, Coordinator

Puget Sound Nuclear Weapon Free Zone

North Bend, WA

Steven G. Gilbert, PhD, DABT

INND (Institute of Neurotoxicology & Neurological

Disorders) Seattle, WA

Charlie Higley **Executive Director** 

Citizens Utility Board of Wisconsin

Madison, WI

Al Gedicks

Wisconsin Resources Protection Council

La Crosse, WI

John LaForge Co-director Nukewatch Luck, WI

Kickapoo Peace Circle

Viroqua, WI

Corey E. Olsen

CEO Pipe Organs/Golden Ponds Farm

Delafield, WI

Christopher LaForge Great Northern Solar Port Wing, WI

## **Organizations in Japan**

Hideyuki Ban

Co-Director

Citizens Nuclear Information Center

Tokyo, Japan

Aileen Mioko Smith **Executive Director** Green Action Kyoto, Japan

Eri Watanabe

Development Finance and Environment Program

Friends of the Earth Japan

Tokyo, Japan

Sato Daisuke Secretary-general No Nukes Asia Forum

Japan

Yumi Kikuchi

Harmonics Life Center

Chiba, Japan

Yumi Kikuchi

Japan Global Peace Campaign

Chiba, Japan

Hideyuki Koyama, Director

Osaka Citizens Against the Mihama, Oi and Takahama

**Nuclear Power Plants** (Mihama-no-Kai) Osaka, Japan

Tsutomu Une

Citizens against Aging Fukushima Nuclear Power

Plants (Fukurou No Kai)

Tokyo, Japan

Takeo Hashizume

Anti-Nuclear Power Kagoshima Network

Kagoshima, Japan

Hashimoto Naoko

Plutonium Action Hiroshima

Hiroshima, Japan

Sachiko Ogawa

Shinagawa Nuclear-Free Women

Tokyo, Japan

Tomoko Anraku

Director

Kaku-no-Gomi (Nuke Waste) Campaign

Chubu (Nagoya, Japan)

Yasunari Fujimoto

Secretary General,

Japan Congress against A- and H-Bombs

(GENSUIKIN) Tokyo, Japan

Yoshinobu Kishida

Oita Network for Denuclearization

Kituki City, Japan

Keiko Nakagawa

Citizens' Group Against Nuclear Power Plants

Takarazuka Takarazuka, Japan

Kazuhide Fukada

Campaign for A Nuclear-free Japan

Fukusima, Japan

Junichi Onuma

"Mitake Water Trust for 5 million inhabitants at Kiso

river basin"

Nagoya City, Japan

Kuniko Takagi Secretary General

The Takagi Fund for Citizen Science

Tokyo, Japan

Takahashi Kiyotaka

Director

**ODA Reform Network** 

Tokyo, Japan

Horiuchi Aoi Secretary General AM-Net Osaka, Japan

Osaka, Japan

Kanna Mitsuta Mekong Watch

Tokyo, Japan

## **Other International Organizations**

Ferdaus A. Quarishi

Progressive Democratic Party

Dhaka, Bangladesh

Petko Kovachev

Green Policy Institute

Sofia, Bulgaria

Stefania Fortugno, LL.B., LL.M.

Legal Counsel for ICUCEC

Inter-Church Uranium Committee Educational Co-

operative

Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada

Angela Bischoff

Greenspiration

Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Sylvie Van Brabant

Director/producer

Films du Rapide-Blanc

Montreal, Quebec, Canada

Nicholas Symons

Terra Cypria (The Cyprus Conservation Foundation)

Paphos District

Cyprus

Women for Peace

Helsinki, Finland

Francis Meuley

Droit au Soleil

France

Maria Arvantiti Sotiropoulou

President

Greek Affiliate of IPPNW

Athens, Greece

People's Movement Against Nuclear Energy (PMANE)

National Alliance of Anti-nuclear Movements

(NAAM)

Tamil Nadu, India

Koesnadi Wirasapoetra

Secretary General

Sarekat Hijau Indonesia (SHI - Indonesian Green Union) Jakarta, Indonesia

Peer de Rijk WISE, World Information Service on Energy Amsterdam, Netherlands

Elena Kobets Environmental Rights Center Bellona St. Petersburg, Russia

Gloria Kuang-Jung Hsu Taiwan Environmental Protection Union Taipei, Taiwan

Jo Brown PCAH (Parents Concerned About Hinkley) Burnham-on-Sea Somerset United Kingdom

Rochdale and Littleborough Peace Group Littleborough, Lancaster United Kingdom